Variations in the Contents of Vitamins A and E during the Ripening of Cheeses with Different Compositions

Isabel Revilla1, Iris Lobos-Ortega2, Ana Vivar-Quintana1, María Inmaculada González-Martín2, José Miguel Hernández-Hierro3 and Claudio González-Pérez2

1Area de Tecnología de los Alimentos, Escuela Politecnica Superior de Zamora, University of Salamanca, Zamora, Spain; 2Departamento de Quimica Analitica, Nutricion y Bromatologia. Facultad de Ciencias Quimicas, University of Salamanca, Salamanca, Spain; 3Food Colour and Quality Laboratory. Department of nutrition and Food Science, University of Sevilla, Sevilla, Spain

Abstract


We investigated the composition in vitamins A and E of cheeses made from the milks of ewes, goats and cows. A total of 84 cheeses of known composition were prepared and controlled to determine the influence of different factors, e.g. the variable proportions of cow’s, ewe’s, and goat’s milks, seasonality (winter/summer), and evolution during the course of ripening. The variable proportions of milk from the different species did not vary in either the amount of vitamin A or that of vitamin E in the cheeses. Seasonality and ripening were seen to have a significant effect on the concentration of vitamin A.

Keywords: vitamins; cow; ewe; goat; season

Fat content is the most quantitatively and qualitatively variable component of milk, depending on the stage of lactation, season, breed, genotype, and feeding (Raynal-Ljutovac et al. 2008). A significant nutritional aspect of milk lipids is that vitamins A, D, E, and K are dissolved in the fat phase. Milk fat represents a good dietary source of vitamin A, vitamin E, and β-carotene (Panfili et al. 1994), but is a poor source of vitamins D and K (McBean & Speckmann 1988).

Vitamin A is a fat-soluble vitamin involved in critical biological functions. It occurs in three primary forms: retinol, retinal, and retinoic acid. The retinol content in milk is influenced by the level of β-carotene in forage (Sharma et al. 1983; Goyal et al. 1984). Dietary β-carotene is converted to retinal in the intestinal epithelium and in the liver by the enzyme β-carotene-15-15'-dioxygenase. In contrast to that of cows, the milks of goats and ewes contain only retinol and generally no β-carotene, which is entirely converted into retinol (Raynal-Ljutovac et al. 2008), thus accounting for the observed differences in colour between bovine and smaller ruminant dairy products (Park et al. 2007).

Vitamin E is considered to act primarily as a lipid-soluble antioxidant, protecting polyunsaturated fatty acids and related substances from peroxidation and hence from rancidity (Bates & Prentice 1994). The chemistry of vitamin E is rather complex since there are eight compounds (four tocopherols and four tocotrienols) that exhibit vitamin E activity. In milk, α-tocopherol accounts for nearly all of vitamin E. In

Supported by the Spanish Junta de Castilla y León, Project No. SA13908 and by the Spanish MICINN for the Juan de la Cierva, Contract No. JCI-2011-09201 (J.M. Hernández-Hierro).
bovine milk, α-tocopherol is the main compound with vitamin E activity (Lindmark-Mansson & Akeson 2000), while very small amounts of β-tocopherol and γ-tocopherol are present. Goat milk is poor in vitamin E (Raynal-Ljutovac et al. 2008) while sheep milk generally has higher contents of it than cow and goat milks (Park et al. 2007).

The variability in the cheese composition as regards fat-soluble constituents (fatty acids, carotenoids, retinol, α-tocopherol) mainly depends on the conditions in which the milk is produced (Lucas et al. 2008a). Thus, the species of animal from which it is obtained is also likely to influence the nutritional characteristics of a cheese to a significant extent (Chilliard & Lamberet 2001; Lucas et al. 2006a). Indeed, the animal diet is another factor that strongly influences the milk composition. Regarding this, the predominant effect of the nature of the basic fodder ration on fat-soluble vitamin contents in milk has been broadened to those present in cheese (Lucas et al. 2008b). The results show that when cows are fed a preserved forage-based ration, the retinol content in cheese fat is increased in a dose-dependent way due to the supplementation with vitamin A. Similarly, the α-tocopherol content in cheese fat is positively influenced by the vitamin E supplementation of preserved forage-based rations, but only at the highest level of supplementation. However, vitamin supplementation of pasture-based rations has no significant effect on the retinol and α-tocopherol contents in cheeses (Lucas et al. 2008b). Moreover, lower retinol concentrations and higher levels of α-tocopherol have been found in organic rather than in conventional mozzarella buffalo milk samples and cow milk products. (Bergamo et al. 2003).

Vitamin A is partially influenced by both the original milk composition and the cheese-making process (Lucas et al. 2006c). Given that carotenoids and retinol are fat-soluble, they mainly behave like milk fat. However, a small proportion of the retinol and carotenoids is associated with whey proteins (Puyol et al. 1991) and/or concentrated in the milk fat globule membrane (Zahar et al. 1995). As a result, a certain amount of these micronutrients could be lost to the whey during cheesemaking. Finally, a study on cow milk cheeses and goat milk cheese has revealed that vitamin E does not depend on the technology used but rather on the composition of the milk (e.g. breeding systems: hay vs. pasture) for both species (Lucas et al. 2006a,b).

Taking into account the scarce data available concerning fat-soluble vitamin contents in cheeses and the influence of several factors on their levels, the aim of the present study was to investigate the effects of the origin of milk (ewe, goat, and cow), of the season and of the ripening time on the vitamin composition of different types of cheese.

**MATERIAL AND METHODS**

To perform the present study, a total of 84 cheeses of known composition were prepared and controlled. They were made of milk collected directly from farms, bovine, ovine, and caprine raw tank milks obtained directly from the producers in Zamora (Spain). Cheeses were prepared in the laboratory according to González Martín et al. (2007): raw milk (40 l), not standardised, was incubated with direct-vat-set starters (MA400; Arroyo Laboratories, Santander, Spain) at 30°C. After 10 min at 32°C, calf rennet (90% chymosin, 10% trypsin, 1 : 150 000 strength) was added to each vat. Coagulation was allowed to take place over 20–70 minutes. When the curds had developed the desired firmness, which was evaluated subjectively, they were cut with a cheese harp until pieces similar in size to a grain of rice were obtained. The curd was then stirred for 30 min and heated for 10–20 min at 37°C until it had reached the desired consistency to improve its drainage with sieves. The curd was packed in round hoops (1 kg) and pressed for 6 h at 1.5 kg/cm² at 20°C. After pressing, the cheeses were salted by soaking them in sodium chloride brine.

Table 1. Composition of the reference cheeses elaborated (winter and summer milk)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Milk cow (%)</th>
<th>Milk ewe (%)</th>
<th>Milk goat (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(18%) at 18°C for 6 hours. The cheeses were then transformed to a drying chamber, where temperature (15°C) and relative humidity (80%) were controlled. Cheeses with 16 different compositions were made, prepared with varying amounts of milk from cows, ewes, and goats, with percentages ranging between 0 and 100%, as shown in Table 1.

**Determination of vitamins in cheese samples.** The concentrations of vitamin A (all *trans* retinol) and vitamin E in the cheeses were measured simultaneously by means of normal phase HPLC using a UV-VIS photodiode-array detector after saponification and hexane extraction, adapted from Lucas *et al.* (2006b). The results were expressed as µg vitamin/100 g fat.

**Statistical analyses.** To study the different factors – month of ripening, seasonality, and the percentages of cow’s, ewe’s, and goat’s milks, the SPSS package (Statistical Package for the Social Sciences) for Windows 15.0 was employed for all the samples analysed. The mean values of the quantitative variables were compared by analysis of variance (ANOVA) considering the differences as significant when *p* was lower than 0.05. With a view to studying which means were different, a Tukey’s multiple comparison test was implemented.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

Table 2 shows the minimum, maximum, and mean concentrations together with the standard deviations (SD) of vitamins A and E contents in the samples of the cheese analysed. Of the 84 cheese analysed, three lacked detectable amounts (< 1 µg/100 g fat) of vitamins: two samples in the case of vitamin A and one sample of vitamin E. The variation in the range obtained for the total number of samples had lower values for vitamin A than those reported for the processed cheese from cows, buffalos and goats (Balestrieri *et al.* 2002, Lucas *et al.* 2008b).

Figure 1 shows the mean values in the cheese samples whose composition included mainly cow’s, ewe’s, or goat’s milks (this situation was considered when the cheese contained amounts equal to or greater than 75% of milk from each of these species). The mean concentrations found for vitamin A were 272.66 ± 52.75, 156.48 ± 76.45, and 189.21 ± 21.50 µg vitamin/100 g fat depending respectively on the contents of cow’s, ewe’s, and goat’s milks. For vitamin E, higher values were found, i.e. 535.91 ± 201.37, 501.23 ± 191.40, and 596.49 ± 213.59 µg vitamin/100 g fat. These results are in agreement with the findings of Lucas *et al.* (2008b) who found higher mean values for vitamin E than for vitamin A in cow and goat milk cheeses. Similar results were obtained when the vitamin contents of sheep (Paccard & Lagriffoul 2006b) and cow milks (Paccard & Lagriffoul 2006a) were analysed, the vitamin E contents being much higher than those of vitamin A.

Since the cheese-making technology was exactly the same for all the cheeses studied, the vitamin losses during the process should be similar regardless of the milk type.

Indeed, previous works have revealed that the variability in the cheese composition with respect to fat soluble components (fatty acid, carotenoids, vitamins A and E) mainly depends on the conditions of the milk production (Lucas *et al.* 2006b). Therefore, the cheese-making technology did not seem to be the reason for the differences between the vitamins A and E concentrations because previous works had reported a decrease in the initial total vitamin A content in milk fat up to 70% during the manufacture of cheeses while the transfer of vitamin E from milk to cheese did not exceed 30% (Lucas *et al.* 2006b).

Owing to the higher average fat content in the sheep’s milk an even higher proportion of lipophilic vitamins in the sheep’s cheese compared to the cow’s

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2. Chemical reference data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>n</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vitamin A (µg/100 g fat)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vitamin E (µg/100 g fat)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Figure 1. Mean concentration of vitamin A and E with respect to the type of milks (cows, ewes, goats) present in the highest amounts in the cheese](image-url)
and goat's cheeses was expected. However, the results did not reveal statistically significant differences for either of these vitamins analysed, depending on the type of milk. Previous results from several authors do not allow any clear influence of species on lipolytic vitamins to be confirmed. Some authors have reported that, generally, ewe's milk contains higher amounts of vitamins (Park et al. 2007), in particular vitamins A and E (Raynal-Ljutovac et al. 2008), than goat and cow milks. However, Kondylí et al. (2012) found higher contents of these vitamins in cow's and sheep's milks than in goat's milk while other authors (Pandya & Ghodke 2007; Lucas et al. 2008b) have reported the opposite. Finally according to Jandal (1996) sheep's and goat's milks show the highest values of vitamins A and E. Previous results suggest a stronger influence of diet than of species on vitamins A and E contents. The amounts of retinol and α-tocopherol secreted to ruminant milk fat depend directly upon their levels in the ration (Sharma et al. 1983). All previous studies focused on the analysis of vitamin concentrations in milk and there are few references in the literature to the contents of these vitamins in cheeses.

The second factor studied here was cheese ripening. The cheeses were processed from the same batch of raw milk and ripened under strictly controlled conditions. Statistical analysis revealed that ripening had an effect (P = 0.05) on the concentration of vitamin A, as concerns both the month of ripening and the type of milk. In the case of ewe's and goat's cheeses, Figure 2 shows an increase in the vitamin A concentration up to the second month of ripening (8 weeks), and this was statistically significant from month 0 to month 2. Cow's milk cheeses showed a progressive decrease in the vitamin A content, which was statistically significant for month 0 of ripening, after which a marked decrease in the concentration was observed.

Previous studies of Edammer cheese revealed a retention of retinol in 12-day-old Edammer cheese of 81% but further ripening led to a retention of about 40% (Hulshof et al. 2006). However, in Gouda cheese it seems that the main losses of retinol occur during the first 12 days while the differences in the retinol content between young (8 week ripening) and mature Gouda cheeses (26 weeks ripening) were small, indicating that ripening does not result in a loss of retinol (Hulshof et al. 2006).

In the case of vitamin E, the global analysis of the mean values did not show any significant effect (P = 0.05) of either the month of ripening or the type of milk employed. The analysis of the data for the different types of milk revealed that only cow's milk showed significant differences between month 0 and the other months of ripening for this vitamin.

The third factor studied, seasonality, was seen to have a significant effect on the concentration of vitamin A (200.70 µg/100 g fat during winter and 212.79 µg/100 g fat during summer) but not on the concentration of vitamin E. Seasonal differences in animal feeding practices may be the main cause for these differences in the nutrients content. The influence of the feeding treatment observed on milk retinol concentration could be due to a difference in retinol precursor concentration in the animal diet and/or a difference in bioavailability of the precursors in the animal body. The grazing herbage positively influences the trans retinol level in milk and seems to be the most critical factor vs. the higher the herbage intake, the higher the retinol concentration in milk in summer and winter (Fedele et al. 2004). Thus, the contents of retinol are higher in the milk from goats reared in the pasture system than...
indoors (Morand-Fehr et al. 2007) which has also been observed for cows (Coulon et al. 2005), while supplying concentrates to grazing goats reduced the retinol content in milk (Fedele et al. 2004).

Previous results regarding the season effect showed that in general the highest values of retinol equivalents were found in the summer and early autumn (Hulshof 2006). These results are in agreement with those of Agabriel et al. (2004) who found significantly higher contents of vitamins A and E in cow milk during the grazing period (May–September) than were those measured during winter (February–March). This was because in these works the animals mainly remained in the pasture during summer and autumn or, when not, were fed freshly cut grass, in addition to ensilage and pellets containing grains. During winter and spring remained in stables and were mainly fed with ensilage.

**CONCLUSION**

The results obtained in the present study reveal higher levels of vitamin E in all the cheeses analysed, regardless of the type of milk from which they were prepared. The cheeses made of cow’s milks had higher vitamin A levels than those made with ewe’s or goat’s milk. However, the goat milk cheeses had the highest vitamin E contents. Vitamin A proved to be more influenced by the factors analysed in this study, with the observation of during summer and autumn significance of seasonality, and higher values found in the cheeses made in summer. In the cheeses made from ewe’s and goat’s milks, only vitamin A was seen to be affected by the length of ripening whereas in the case of cheeses made of cow’s milk a decrease in the levels of both vitamins was observed over the ripening period.

**References**


Received for publication November 30, 2012
Accepted after corrections October 18, 2013

Corresponding author:
Prof Isabel Revilla, University of Salamanca, Área de Tecnología de los Alimentos, Escuela Politecnica Superior de Zamora, 49022 Zamora, Spain; E-mail: irevilla@usal.es