Combination of let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p is suitable normalizer for studying microRNA expression in skin tissue of Liaoning cashmere goat during hair follicle cycle

W.L. Bai¹, Y.L. Dang¹, R.H. Yin¹, R.L. Yin², W.Q. Jiang¹, Z.Y. Wang¹, Y.B. Zhu¹, J.J. Wang¹, Z.H. Zhao³, G.B. Luo¹

¹College of Animal Science and Veterinary Medicine, Shenyang Agricultural University, Shenyang, P.R. China
²Research Academy of Animal Husbandry and Veterinary Medicine Sciences of Jilin Province, Changchun, P.R. China
³College of Animal Science and Veterinary Medicine, Jilin University, Changchun, P.R. China

ABSTRACT: The microRNAs are non-coding RNA molecules of approximately 20–22 nucleotides that are found to be implicated in a wide range of physiological processes. In this study, the suitability of 10 candidate reference RNAs was evaluated for microRNA expression data in the skin tissue of Liaoning cashmere goat including 1 small nuclear RNA (snRNA; RNU6B), 1 small nucleolar RNA (snoRNA; Z30), 1 rRNA (5S), 1 transfer RNA (tRNA; Met-tRNA), and 6 microRNAs (miR; let-7d-5p, miR-15a-5p, miR-26a-5p, miR-125a-5p, miR-214-3p, and miR-221-3p). Based on geNorm and NormFinder algorithms, we identified let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p as the most stable reference RNAs. Also, three reference RNAs (let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p) were sufficient for the normalization of microRNA expression data in the skin of this breed. We further assessed the suitability of let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p in a combination as reference RNAs through detecting the relative expression of miR-24-3p, miR-29a-3p, miR-145a-5p, and miR-205-5p as putative genes of interest. Significant differences were revealed in the relative expression of miR-24-3p, miR-29a-3p, miR-145a-5p, and miR-205-5p at telogen stage of hair follicle cycle when a combination of let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p vs a single let-7d-5p were used as reference RNA. Based on the results from this study, we suggested that the combination of let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p as normalizers for microRNA expression data would be more reliable than that of single let-7d-5p, and the geometric mean of these three microRNAs (let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p) can be used for the normalization of microRNAs expression data in the skin of Liaoning cashmere goat.

Keywords: cashmere goat skin; microRNA expression reference; expression stability

INTRODUCTION

Liaoning cashmere goat, the most productive cashmere breed in China, is mainly raised in the Buyun Mountains of Liaotung Peninsula (McGregor et al. 1991). The goats of this breed are white with horns in both sexes. It lives in a humid environment with mean temperature of 7–8°C, rainfall of 700–900 mm, and frost free period of 150–170 days. There are around 1.5 million individuals of this
breed. It is adapted well to the local environment. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents. Although it has a relatively good meat-producing ability with average adult weight being 91.6 kg (male) and 43.8 kg (female), the main use of this breed is cashmere with the average adult cashmere yield of 540 g (male) and 470 g (female) (Bai et al. 2012). It is of great economic importance to local residents.

**MATERIAL AND METHODS**

**Samples, RNA extraction, and cDNA synthesis.** Tissue biopsies of skin of approximately 1 cm² were collected from six female Liaoning cashmere goats in June (early anagen), October (anagen), January (catagen), and March (telogen). The animals sampled for skin tissue were in good general health, and avoided common traceable genetic relationships. The skin tissue samples collected were immediately put into Sample Protector (TaKaRa Biotechnology Co. Ltd., Dalian, China). They were transported to laboratory in low temperature condition and frozen at –80°C before RNA extraction. All experimental procedures were reviewed and approved by the Animal Experimental Committee of Shenyang Agricultural University.

Using the RNAiso reagent kit (TaKaRa) we isolated total RNA from different samples according to the manufacturer’s instructions. The integrity of total RNA extracted was verified by 1.5% agarose gel electrophoresis (Figure S1). Based on the ultraviolet spectrometer, we assessed the purity and quantity of the total RNA with the ratio of OD₂₆₀/OD₂₈₀ being 1.8–2.0 for each sample. The total RNA was further treated with DNase I (TaKaRa) to exclude the contamination from residual genomic DNA. Lack of genomic DNA contamination was confirmed by a null result from PCR amplification reaction using the digested DNA as a template. Using the One Step PrimeScript miRNA cDNA synthesis kit (code D350; TaKaRa), the first strand of cDNA was synthesized for each sample following the manufacturer’s instructions. The reactions of reverse transcription were prepared in a total volume of 20 µl containing: 2x miRNA Reaction Buffer Mix (10 µl), 0.1% BSA (2 µl), miRNA PrimeScript® RT Enzyme Mix (2 µl), Total RNA (1 µl, 1 µg/µl), and RNase Free dH₂O (5 µl) (all TaKaRa). The reaction conditions were as follows: 37°C for 60 min followed by 85°C for 5 s. Absence of inhibitors was tested by different dilutions.

**Candidate reference selection, primer design, and qPCR**. A total of 10 candidate reference RNAs were selected including 1 small nuclear RNA (snRNA; RNU6B), 1 small nucleolar RNA (snRNA; Z30), 1 rRNA (5S), 1 transfer RNA (tRNA; Met-tRNA), and 6 microRNAs (miR; let-7d-5p, miR-15a-5p, miR-26a-5p, miR-125a-5p, miR-214-3p, and miR-221-3p). Also, four miRNAs (miR-24-3p, miR-29a-3p, miR-145a-5p, and miR-205-5p) were used as interest miRNA to validate the identified
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gene symbol$^1$</th>
<th>Full gene name</th>
<th>Reference in GenBank or miRBase$^2$</th>
<th>NcRNA species</th>
<th>Primer sequence$^3$ (5'-3')</th>
<th>$T_a$ (°C)</th>
<th>Slope</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
<th>$E^4$ (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RNU6B</td>
<td>U6 small nuclear 2 RNA</td>
<td>NR_002752</td>
<td>snRNA</td>
<td>F: AAAATTGGAAAGCATACAGAGAG&lt;br&gt;R: AATAATTGGAAAGCTTCACAGAA</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>-3.351</td>
<td>0.998</td>
<td>98.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Z30</td>
<td>Z30 small nucleolar RNA</td>
<td>AJ007733</td>
<td>snoRNA</td>
<td>F: GCGATGATGATGGAGATTAGAG&lt;br&gt;R: TCAGAGAGAGAGATGAAGAGAT</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>-3.326</td>
<td>0.999</td>
<td>99.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5S</td>
<td>5S ribosomal RNA</td>
<td>X57170</td>
<td>rRNA</td>
<td>F: CGGCCATACCCACCGTTGAAC&lt;br&gt;R: AAGGGGTCCTCCCATACCAAGT</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>-3.392</td>
<td>0.998</td>
<td>97.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-5p</td>
<td>MicroRNA-7-5p</td>
<td>MIMAT0000383</td>
<td>miRNA</td>
<td>F: CGGAGGGTAGATTGTTGCAATGTT&lt;br&gt;R: GCTCGAGAGAGGTGTTAGTTG</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>-3.371</td>
<td>0.997</td>
<td>98.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miR-15a-5p</td>
<td>MicroRNA-15a-5p</td>
<td>MIMAT0000526</td>
<td>miRNA</td>
<td>F: CGTACGACATACATGATGTG&lt;br&gt;R: GCGTATTGTTGCCGTTGTTG</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>-3.388</td>
<td>0.996</td>
<td>97.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miR-26a-5p</td>
<td>MicroRNA-26a-5p</td>
<td>MIMAT0000533</td>
<td>miRNA</td>
<td>F: CGTCAAGTATCCAGGTAGAGCT&lt;br&gt;R: GGGCGGTCCTCCCATACAAAGT</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>-3.218</td>
<td>0.992</td>
<td>104.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miR-125a-5p</td>
<td>MicroRNA-125a-5p</td>
<td>MIMAT0000135</td>
<td>miRNA</td>
<td>F: TCCCTGAGACCTTTAACACG&lt;br&gt;R: GCGGAGAGATGTTGTCG</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>-3.222</td>
<td>0.995</td>
<td>104.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miR-214-3p</td>
<td>MicroRNA-214-3p</td>
<td>MIMAT0000661</td>
<td>miRNA</td>
<td>F: ACAGCAGGCACAGACAGCAC&lt;br&gt;R: GCGTATTGTTGCCTTTGG</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>-3.347</td>
<td>0.997</td>
<td>99.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miR-221-3p</td>
<td>MicroRNA-221-3p</td>
<td>MIMAT0000669</td>
<td>miRNA</td>
<td>F: GAGCTACATGTGCTGTCG&lt;br&gt;R: GGGCGGTCCTCCCATACAAAGT</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>-3.384</td>
<td>0.998</td>
<td>97.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miR-24-3p</td>
<td>MicroRNA-24-3p</td>
<td>MIMAT0000219</td>
<td>miRNA</td>
<td>F: TGGCTCAGTTCAGGAC&lt;br&gt;R: GCGTATTGTTGCAATGTTG</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>-3.377</td>
<td>0.999</td>
<td>97.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miR-29a-3p</td>
<td>MicroRNA-29a-3p</td>
<td>MIMAT0000535</td>
<td>miRNA</td>
<td>F: CGTACGACATACATGATGTG&lt;br&gt;R: GCGTATTGTTGCAATGTTG</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>-3.401</td>
<td>0.997</td>
<td>98.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miR-145a-3p</td>
<td>MicroRNA-145a-3p</td>
<td>MIMAT0000157</td>
<td>miRNA</td>
<td>F: GTCCTGAGAGAC&lt;br&gt;R: GCGTATTGTTGCAATGTTG</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>-3.366</td>
<td>0.999</td>
<td>98.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miR-205-5p</td>
<td>MicroRNA-205-5p</td>
<td>MIMAT0000238</td>
<td>miRNA</td>
<td>F: TCCCTACATGTGCTGTCG&lt;br&gt;R: GCGTATTGTTGCAATGTTG</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>-3.355</td>
<td>0.998</td>
<td>98.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NcRNA = noncoding RNA, snRNA = small nuclear RNA, snoRNA = small nucleolar RNA, rRNA = ribosomal RNA, tRNA = transfer RNA, miRNA = microRNA, $T_a$ = annealing temperature, $E$ = efficiency of the real-time PCR

$^1$Primers for RNU6B, Z30, 5S, and Met-tRNA were designed in our previous study (Bai et al. 2013), and their amplicon lengths were 79-, 91-, 91-, and 72-bp, respectively. Amplicon length of the 10 microRNAs analyzed is not available because of the use of universal reverse primer obtained from the kit (code D350; TaKaRa Biotechnology Co. Ltd., Dalian, China).


$^3$F = forward, R = reverse; the anti-sense primer of all the miRNAs analyzed was obtained from the kit (code D350; TaKaRa), being a universal miRNA reverse primer.

$^4$calculated as $E = 10^{-1/slope}$ – 1
optimal reference RNAs for microRNA expression analysis in the skin tissue of Liaoning cashmere goat. The information of primers used was shown in Table 1.

In a LightCycler 480 Real Time PCR system (Roche Diagnostics GmbH, Mannheim, Germany), we carried out the qPCR amplification reaction with SYBR® Green I assay (TaKaRa). Six-point standard curve was produced for each reference RNA by the 10-fold serial dilutions of cDNA. Reactions were prepared in a total volume of 20 µl containing: 2.0 µl cDNA, 0.8 µl of each 10µM primer, 10 µl SYBR® Premix Ex Taq™ (TaKaRa), and 6.4 µl RNase/DNase-free sterile water. The reaction solution of qPCR was prepared in a final volume of 20 µl as described above, with an annealing temperature of 61 or 63°C (Table 1). The let-7d-5p alone and the geometric mean of let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p were used to normalize the expression level of 4 miRNAs of interest (miR-24-3p, miR-29a-3p, miR-145a-5p, and miR-205-5p), respectively.

Normalized qPCR data are presented as log₂ n-fold change relative to early anagen. In order to estimate standard errors at early anagen and prevent possible biases in statistical analysis, we transformed normalized data to obtain a perfect stability of 10 candidate reference RNAs following the authors’ instructions. The geNorm calculates the expression stability measure M as the average pairwise variation for the reference RNA with all other tested reference RNAs. Stepwise exclusion of the reference RNA with the highest M allows ranking of the tested reference RNAs based on their M value. NormFinder estimates expression stability based on intra- and inter-group variations for candidate reference RNAs. We also evaluated the correlation coefficient (r) between the geNorm M value and the NormFinder stability value using SPSS software (Version 16.0.2, 2008). The geNorm algorithm was used to determine the optimal number of reference RNAs for miRNA data normalization (Vandesompele et al. 2002).

Evaluation and validation of identified suitable reference RNAs for normalization. The validation of the identified suitable normalizers for studying miRNA expression was evaluated through detecting the relative expression of 4 miRNAs of interest including miR-24-3p, miR-29a-3p, miR-145a-5p, and miR-205-5p. The reaction solution of qPCR was prepared in a total volume of 20 µl as described above, with an annealing temperature of 61 or 63°C (Table 1). The let-7d-5p alone and the geometric mean of let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p were used to normalize the expression level of 4 miRNAs of interest (miR-24-3p, miR-29a-3p, miR-145a-5p, and miR-205-5p), respectively.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Based on the geNorm analysis, the expression stabilities of the 10 candidate reference RNAs were found to be different with the M values ranging from 0.259 to 0.648 below the default limit of 1.5 accepted by geNorm (Vandesompele et al. 2002). The average M value of the pair miR-26a-5p and let-7d-5p was the lowest, and this pair was identified as the most suitable reference RNA with average M values of < 0.3. The miR-15a-5p was ranked as the third most stable reference RNA. The M value of 5S was the highest among the candidate reference RNAs at 0.648, and was found to be the worst performing normalizer for miRNA expression analysis in the skin tissue of Liaoning cashmere goat during hair follicle cycling (Figure 1A). The NormFinder algorithm was also used to evaluate the expression stabilities of the 10 candidate reference RNAs, and the results obtained were presented in Figure 1B. Throughout the hair follicle cycling, let-7d-5p was found to be the most stably expressed reference RNA, followed by miR-26a-5p and miR-15a-5p,
whereas the \(5S\) and \(RNU6B\) exhibited the least expression stability. On the whole, the results from NormFinder algorithm were consistent with that of geNorm analysis with an exception of two candidate reference RNAs \(miR-221-3p\) and \(Met-tRNA\), the ranking of which were inverted. On the other hand, we noted a robust correlation \((r = 0.986, P < 0.01)\) between the geNorm \(M\) value and the NormFinder stability value by analyzing the correlation coefficient (Figure 2A), which further confirmed the reliability of the results obtained from the present study. 

Previously, \(5S\) was used as normalizer for miRNA expression analysis in the skin of cashmere goat (Fu et al. 2012). In the present work, however, it was remarkable that \(5S\) was ranked as the least-stable reference RNA in the skin of Liaoning cashmere goat, based on both geNorm and NormFinder

Figure 1. Expression stability of 10 candidate reference RNAs in the skin tissue of Liaoning cashmere goat

(A) output charts for average expression stability (\(M\)) of 10 candidate reference RNAs based on the geNorm algorithm where \(M\) value was calculated by stepwise exclusion of the least-stable candidate RNA. A lower \(M\) value means higher expression stability. The most stable RNA pair \((let-7d-5p\ and \(miR-26a-5p\)) was indicated by asterisk, (B) output charts for stability index values of 10 candidate reference RNAs based on the NormFinder algorithm. A lower index value of stability indicates higher expression stability. The miRNA \(let-7d-5p\) was identified as the most stable reference RNA that was indicated by asterisk

Figure 2. Correlation analysis between \(M\) values (geNorm) and stability values (NormFinder) and determination of the optimal number of reference RNAs

(A) correlation of \(M\) value and stability value that was evaluated by the coefficient of determination with SPSS software (Version 16, 2008), (B) determination of the optimal number of reference RNAs for the normalization of miRNAs expression data that was performed by pairwise variation analysis based on geNorm algorithm. Y-axis indicated pairwise variation \(V(V_{n+1})\) between the normalization factors \(NF_n\) and \(NF_{n+1}\). When cut-off value of 0.10 was used, the three most stable microRNAs \((let-7d-5p,\ miR-26a-5p,\ and\ miR-15a-5p)\) were sufficient to provide a reliable normalization factor in the skin of Liaoning cashmere goat
computational programs (Figure 1). Therefore, it appeared that 5S was unsuitable for the normalization of miRNA expression data in the skin tissue of Liaoning cashmere goat during hair follicle cycling. RNU6B was previously used as normalizer for miRNA expression analysis in other organs of ruminants, such as mammary gland of cattle (Li et al. 2012; Wang et al. 2012) and goat (Ji et al. 2012). Also, it was used in the normalization of miRNA expression data in the skin of alpaca (He et al. 2010). In this study, however, RNU6B exhibited the second-lowest stability in both geNorm and NormFinder analysis (Figure 1). Additionally, Met-tRNA (along with RNU6B) was also used as reference RNA for microRNA expression data in different tissues of human and mouse (Liu et al. 2004). In the present work, however, Met-tRNA exhibited the third- and fourth-lowest stability in geNorm and NormFinder algorithms, respectively (Figure 1). Similarly, it was demonstrated that Met-tRNA was inappropriate as normalizer for miRNA expression data in the mammary gland of yak (Bai et al. 2013) and pig (Gü et al. 2012).

In the qPCR-based expression analysis of miRNA, the reference RNAs used should share similar properties with miRNA molecules, such as size. Numerous noncoding small RNA species (below 200 bp) are found to be closer in size to microRNA including tRNA, rRNA, snRNA, and snoRNA, and have previously been used as reference RNAs in the normalization of miRNA qPCR data (Davoren et al. 2008). In this study, the 10 candidate RNAs were selected mainly based on the following considerations. Firstly, RNU6B, 5S, and Z30 were previously used as normalizers for miRNA expression analysis in the skin of alpaca (He et al. 2010), goat (Fu et al. 2012), and human (Xia et al. 2013), respectively. Secondly, Met-tRNA was not typically used in skin tissue related experiments of goats, however, it was used as normalizer for miRNA expression data in various tissues of human and mouse (Liu et al. 2004), and was explored as candidate reference RNA in other organs of ruminants, such as the mammary gland of yak (Bai et al. 2013). Thirdly, the expressions of the 6 candidate reference miRNAs (let-7d-5p, miR-15a-5p, miR-26a-5p, miR-125a-5p, miR-214-3p, and miR-221-3p) were found to be relatively stable in the skin of mouse during hair follicle cycling (Mardaryev et al. 2010).

Over the past few decades, it was demonstrated that the use of a single reference appears to be insufficient in the normalization of qPCR data (Tricarico et al. 2002; Vandesompele et al. 2002; Pfaffl et al. 2004), and the use of multiple references was recommended for qPCR data normalization (Brinkhof et al. 2006; Peters et al. 2007; Varshney et al. 2012). Using geNorm algorithm, therefore, we further determined the optimal number of reference RNAs required for data normalization of miRNA quantitation through calculating the pairwise variation (Vn/n+1) between each combination of sequential normalization factors (NFn and NFn+1). An additional inclusion of a less stable reference RNA resulting in a large variation suggests that this reference should not be included in the calculation for a reliable analysis. In the present work, a lower variation was observed in the expression stability of the tested miRNAs (Figure 1), therefore the cutoff was reduced from 0.15 to 0.10 as suggested by Vandesompele et al. (2002). As shown in Figure 2B, it appeared that three RNAs (V3/4) were suitable for miRNA data normalization in the skin of Liaoning cashmere goat during hair follicle cycling. Factually, addition of a fourth gene (V3/4) would increase reliability in normalization but it was not justified given the lower cut-off value of 0.10 used (Vandesompele et al. 2002; Bionaz and Loor 2007). As shown in Figure 1, let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p were ranked as top three most stable references by both geNorm and NormFinder algorithms. Therefore, the use of let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p in a combination would be sufficient for an accurate normalization of microRNA expression data in the skin of Liaoning cashmere goat during hair follicle cycling.

In the present work, we further evaluated the suitability of let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p as combined normalizers for miRNA expression data in the skin of Liaoning cashmere goat. Using a combination of three miRNAs (let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p) against a single one (let-7d-5p) as references, the relative expression of four putative interest miRNAs (miR-24-3p, miR-29a-3p, miR-145a-5p, and miR-205-5p) was investigated in the skin of Liaoning cashmere goat during hair follicle cycling. The relative expressions of miR-24-3p, miR-29a-3p, miR-145a-5p, and miR-205-5p are presented in Figure 3. On the whole, the expression patterns of the 4 microRNAs analyzed were similar to those recorded in the skin of mouse during hair follicle cycling (Mardaryev et al. 2010). On the other hand, although a highly similar change
trend was observed for each microRNA analyzed between using 3 combined references (let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p) and one single reference (let-7d-5p), significant differences were revealed for each microRNA in the relative expression at telogen stage \((P < 0.05)\) (Figure 3). Moreover, at telogen stage, a significant difference was revealed in the relative expression of miR-145a-5p compared with early anagen stage \((P < 0.05)\) when using 1 single reference, but not when using 3 combined references (Figure 3C). Also, in comparison to early anagen stage, a significant difference was recorded in the relative expression of miR-205-5p at telogen stage when using 3 combined references, but not when using 1 single reference (Figure 3D). In fact, compared with mRNA, more rigorous strategies should be introduced for the normalization of miRNA expression data, in that miRNA might regulate multiple targets. As a result, their effects could be amplified in a pathway (Croce and Calin 2005). In that case, even a small change in the miRNAs expression level might mean significant biological effects (Davoren et al. 2008; Peltier and Latham 2008).
Therefore, it would be a better choice to use three combined references (let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p) instead of a single let-7d-5p to obtain an accurate normalization of miRNAs expression data in the skin of Liaoning cashmere goat.

CONCLUSION

In the present work, we evaluated the suitability of 10 candidate reference RNAs for normalization of miRNA expression data in the skin tissue of Liaoning cashmere goat. Three miRNAs (let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p) were identified as the most suitable reference RNAs. Based on the results from the present work, we recommended that the combination of let-7d-5p, miR-26a-5p, and miR-15a-5p could be used for the normalization of miRNA expression data in the skin of Liaoning cashmere goat.

REFERENCES


Received: 2014–12–08
Accepted after corrections: 2015–09–21

Corresponding Author
Dr. Rong H. Yin, Shenyang Agricultural University, College of Animal Science and Veterinary Medicine,
Dongling Road 120, Shenyang 110866, P.R. China
Phone: +86 24 884 871 56, e-mail: yinronghuan@163.com