

Forest reclamation of dumpsites of coal combustion by-products (CCB)

P. ČERMÁK

Research Institute for Soil and Water Conservation, Prague, Czech Republic

ABSTRACT: The present paper describes the reclamation of dumpsites of coal ash – coal combustion by-products (CCB) generated by the burning of brown coal in thermal power plants. It evaluates the soil properties of formed Anthroposols and growth vitality of the forest tree species *Quercus robur* L., *Quercus rubra* L., *Pinus sylvestris* L., *Betula verrucosa* Ehrh., *Populus tremula* L., *Populus nigra* L., *Salix fragilis* L., *Salix alba* L., *Alnus glutinosa* (L.) Gaertn. The best growth vitality at these sites was reached in tree species of seed origin from the vegetation series of primary succession. Deformations of the taproot (taproot laterals) in trees under 10 years of age were observed on Anthroposol from coal ash in *Salix alba* L., *Salix fragilis* L., *Populus tremula* L., *Populus nigra* L. and *Populus alba* L. and in the overlaying of the compacted stabilize with a layer of reclaimable soil up to 0.5 m in *Pinus sylvestris* L., *Alnus glutinosa* (L.) Gaertn. and *Quercus rubra* L.

Keywords: forest reclamation; Anthroposol; coal-ash dumpsite; coal combustion by-products; soil properties; growth vitality; root system

The reclamation of coal ash before reforestation coming from the combustion of different types of coal in thermal power stations and deposited in settling pits by hydraulic sluicing was most frequently done in the Czech Republic before 1990 by the overlaying of its surface with suitable reclaimable soils (topsoil, pressmud) 5–10 cm in thickness and by grassing down. Taxa (ŠPIŘÍK 1973; MALÝ, ŠPIŘÍK 1975) usable on all types of coal ash coming from black and brown coal including lignite were considered as “suitable” tree species with higher ameliorative effects. This group most frequently comprised *Alnus incana* (L.) Moench., *Alnus glutinosa* (L.) Gaertn., *Populus tremula* L., *Populus alba* L., *Tilia cordata* Mill., *Robinia pseudoacacia* L., *Salix fragilis* L., *Acer negundo* L., *Crataegus oxyacantha* L., *Ligustrum vulgare* L., *Physocarpus opulifolius* Maxim., *Hippophaë rhamnoides* L., *Caragana arborescens* Lam. The second group was composed of “partly suitable” tree species but of greater eco-

nomic importance; their growth on coal ash was not always convincing but they were also usable if other ameliorative measures (green manuring, topsoil application to the hole before outplanting, additional application of mineral fertilizers, mulching around plants) were parallelly taken in the course of reforestation of these localities. *Quercus robur* L., *Quercus rubra* L., *Acer pseudoplatanus* L., *Acer platanoides* L., *Ulmus laevis* Pall., *Fraxinus excelsior* L., *Larix decidua* Mill., *Pinus sylvestris* L., *Pinus nigra* Arn., *Spirea salicifolia* L., *Cornus sanguinea* L., *Lonicera tataricum* L. were included in this group most frequently. Another technique of reforestation of these localities consisted in the planting of tree species with high ameliorative effects – *Alnus glutinosa* (L.) Gaertn. or *Alnus incana* (L.) Moench., and only after on-site conditions had improved (after 10–15 years), the planting of tree species of greater economic importance was envisaged. Adequate reclamation technologies on similar types of recent

Supported by the Ministry of Agriculture of the Czech Republic, Project No. 0002704901.

formations are currently recommended also in other countries (JUWARKAR et al. 1993; DOBSON, MOFFAT 1993; SRIVASTAVA et al. 1995; ALONSO et al. 2002; ATHY et al. 2006).

The experience with reclamations of new dumpsites of coal combustion by-products (hereinafter CCB), deposited in a dry state after 1995 in connection with the introduction of other technologies of desulphurization of thermal power stations in the CR, is scarce. Particularly a compacted stabilize and the proposal of a suitable physiological depth for the development of tree taxa are reclamation problems whereas the knowledge acquired by studying the coal ash of several meter thickness deposited by hydraulic sluicing with similar profile chemical and physical properties can be applied only partly. Currently, projects solving the problem of CCB most frequently recommend the application of technologies when they are overlaid with soils of different pedological quality and of maximum thickness 0.7 m, in practice usually max. 0.5 m.

To test suitable reclamation methods for these dumpsites a field trial with the planting of *Pinus sylvestris* L. and *Quercus robur* L. was conducted already in 1996 on sluiced coal ash treated with additive-containing agglomerate (CaO) and with agglomerate without additives (HERYNEK 1997, 1998) in the area of the power station Mělník in Panský les locality. Another experimental object for the evaluation of the condition of reforested coal ash settling pits in the CR (MINX 2003) was established in the area of the power station in Chvaletice (ČERMÁK, KOHEL 2005) that has been studied continually and where reclamation variants of Anthroposol formation for forestry purposes have been evaluated: besides the conventional method of the overlaying of the compacted stabilize with soil layer (up to 0.5 m in thickness) the overlaying with different reclamation substrates up to 1.5 m in thickness has been tested.

MATERIAL AND METHOD

Coal combustion by-products (CCB, certified products) currently originate from power-station treated fly ash from coal burning in thermal power stations: they are used in the building industry or they are deposited on dumpsites in a dry state and used for reclamation purposes:

Agglomerate – fly ash without additives, treated with mixing water (ca 25% proportion). Chemical and physical properties of this product are similar to those of coal ash deposited by hydraulic sluicing.

Stabilizate – a mixture of fly ash treated with 1–2% CaO, 25% water, slag and FDG gypsum. Chemical and physical properties contribute to the origination of an adverse soil environment (high alkalinity, cementing effects).

FDG (flue gas desulphurization) gypsum (dihydrate of calcium sulphate) – a product of flue-gas scrubbing by wet limestone washing. Chemical and physical properties contribute to the origination of an adverse soil environment (high alkalinity, cementing effects, high content of sulphates and chlorides).

On-site characteristics of evaluated coal ash dumpsites

Panský les locality is situated in the area with annual precipitation amount of 489 mm and vegetation precipitation amount of 339 mm. An experimental plot for the testing of coal combustion by-products for forest reclamation purposes (reclamation variant “B”) was established on coal ash deposited by hydraulic sluicing while two technologies were used to treat its surface. Compacted stabilize 0.5 m in thickness (reclamation variant “C”), which would reduce the seepage of precipitation waters into the subsoil, and agglomerate without additives were applied to one part of this plot whereas the other part of this plot was treated only with agglomerate without additives 0.50 m in thickness. The final treatment of the surface of the entire experimental plot before reforestation consisted in the application of a cover layer composed of pressmud and cellulose sludge 5–10 cm in thickness that would reduce evapotranspiration, surface overheating and dustiness. The entire plot was reforested with bare-rooted planting material (2/0) and containerized planting material (2/1) grown in removable PVC containers, and the plants were set out into dug holes. *Quercus robur* L. and *Pinus sylvestris* L. were used for reforestation. The evaluated tree species of seed origin (primary succession) in this locality are individuals occurring at a site with hydraulically sluiced coal ash where its surface was covered (to prevent dustiness) with a geotextile only (reclamation variant “D”).

Chvaletice locality is situated in the area with annual precipitation amount of 593 mm and vegetation precipitation amount of 378 mm. The dumpsite is the space of a former quarry for manganese-pyrite slates that was filled in 1980–1995 with coal ash from the combustion of brown coal in a thermal power station and after 1995 only compacted stabilize was deposited in a dry state to the level of the terrain that corresponded to the original landscape before

the extraction of slates. An experimental plot for the testing of coal combustion by-products for forest reclamation purposes was established on compacted stabilize (reclamation variant "C") using the technology of stabilize overlaying with reclaimable soil 0.4–0.5 m in thickness (reclamation variant "A"). The entire plot was reforested with bare-rooted planting material (2/0) that was outplanted with a trench planter. *Pinus sylvestris* L. (more than 60%) was mostly used for reforestation, other tree species were *Alnus glutinosa* (L.) Gaertn., *Quercus rubra* L., *Larix decidua* Mill., *Betula verrucosa* Ehrh., *Acer pseudoplatanus* L. and *Populus tremula* L. The evaluated tree species of seed origin (primary succession) in this locality are again individuals occurring at a site with hydraulically sluiced coal ash where its surface was covered (to prevent dustiness) with a geotextile only (reclamation variant "D").

Method of evaluation of the development stage of forest tree species and soil properties

In **Panský les locality** (reclamation variant "B") the forest tree species were evaluated at the age of 7 years while in **Chvaletice locality** (reclamation variant "A") the age of the evaluated forest tree species was 5 years. As for the tree species of seed origin (reclamation variant "C") the individuals at both localities were max. 10 years old (the time since the termination of coal ash sluicing). The tree species were evaluated for their health status (damage caused by biotic and abiotic factors) and shoot length; after the trees were lifted from the soil profile either by hand or by an excavator, we evaluated the characteristics of the spatial distribution of horizontal skeletal roots, presence of anchor roots, taproot (lateral taproots) and fine roots (less than 1 mm in diameter), width and depth of root penetration into the soil profile, root system deformations (spiral coiling of roots – knob, changes in the vertical orientation of taproot growth). The transversal transect – the wall denuding the root system in the formed soil profile of Anthroposol was an auxiliary method used

to evaluate the root system development in the tree species in Chvaletice locality (reclamation variant "A"). The determination of soil properties of evaluated Anthroposols (texture, soil reaction, sorption properties, content of carbonates, total nitrogen, organic matters and available nutrients – P, K, Mg, Ca) and of the nutrient status of assimilatory tissues in some tree species taxa in connection with the evaluated soil condition was a part of these investigations.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Soil properties of evaluated Anthroposols

From the aspect of the particle-size composition Anthroposols composed solely of coal ash without additives represent a similar soil condition, i.e. they are in the category of the sandy to loam-sandy texture. An exception is the variant of Anthroposol formed on the compacted stabilize with reclaimable soil where the overlaying stratum can be classified as sandy-loam. The content of particle-size category I (< 0.01 mm) in the overlaying stratum composed of reclaimable soil ranged at the level of variance 20–29% (sd 3.263), in coal ash deposited by hydraulic sluicing at the level of variance 6–15% (sd 2.764), in the agglomerate at the level of variance 6–12% (sd 2.147) and in the stabilize at the level of variance 7–13% (sd 2.052). In Anthroposols composed only of coal ash particularly the total content of nitrogen and organic matters is considered as low and sorption properties as unsuitable from the aspect of reclamation. On the contrary, this variant has a higher content of phosphorus, potassium and magnesium compared to the overlaying with soil layer and is also characterized by some specific physical properties such as high porosity (62–67%) and low bulk density (0.6–0.7 g/cm³). Reclaiming material and uncompacted stabilize are interesting from the aspect of reclamation; they cause a marked initial increase in soil alkalinity (8.0–8.5) compared to the agglomerate but they also positively influence sorption properties. Table 1 shows

Table 1. Chemical and other properties of soil

| Reclamation state | pH KCl | CaCO ₃ (%) | N _t (%) | C _{ox} (%) | CEC (cmol ⁺ /kg) | Content of available nutrients (mg/kg) | | | |
|-------------------|---------|-----------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------------------|---------|---------|---------------|
| | | | | | | P | K | Mg | Ca |
| "A" | 6.3–6.8 | < 0.1–0.7 | 0.05–0.07 | 0.4–0.5 | < 5.0–12.8 | 1–9 | 43–121 | 113–348 | 2,655–2,958 |
| "B" | 6.8–7.0 | < 0.1 | < 0.05 | 0.3–0.4 | < 5.0 | 28–40 | 164–243 | 429–703 | 624–1,050 |
| "C" | 7.9–8.1 | 1.2–2.8 | < 0.05 | 0.3–0.7 | 13.9–19.3 | 33–38 | 194–221 | 515–712 | 13,112–13,920 |
| "D" | 5.3–6.0 | < 0.1 | 0.05–0.06 | 1.4–2.5 | < 5.0–5.8 | 14–26 | 122–163 | 113–230 | 920–1,536 |



Fig. 1. The root system of *Betula verrucosa* Ehrh. of seed origin in a coal-ash settling pit



Fig. 3. The root system of *Pinus sylvestris* L. of seed origin in a coal-ash settling pit

the determined soil properties of evaluated reclamation variants.

Evaluation of growth vitality of forest tree species

Betula verrucosa Ehr.: a taxon of very high reclamation importance, little damaged by biotic factors. Rhizological characterization (Fig. 1) of individual trees of seed origin at the age under 10 years on Anthroposol formed from coal ash only shows the system of uniformly distributed horizontal roots, placed in the surface soil horizon to 0.1 m and penetrating into the total soil-profile width of 7 m, which

are complemented by numerous vertical anchor roots penetrating into the soil profile to the total depth of 0.4 m.

Salix alba L.: a taxon of very high reclamation importance, little damaged by biotic factors. Rhizological characterization (Fig. 2) of individual trees of seed origin at the age under 10 years on Anthroposol formed from coal ash only shows the formation of the uniformly distributed or one-sided system of horizontal roots reaching the total width of root penetration into the soil profile 10 m, numerous vertical anchor roots and the taproot (taproot laterals) which is bent into a horizontal position in 80% of individuals at a depth of 0.4–0.7 m, is branching and some



Fig. 2. The root system of *Salix alba* L. of seed origin in a coal-ash settling pit



Fig. 4. Development of the root system in the bare-rooted planting material of *Pinus sylvestris* L. at a site with the overlaying of the compacted stabilizate with soil layer



Fig. 5. Characterization of the density of terminal rootlets in the central part of the root system of *Populus nigra* L. of seed origin



Fig. 6. Development of the root system in the bare-rooted planting material of *Alnus glutinosa* (L.) Gaertn. at a site with the overlaying of the compacted stabilize with soil layer

roots continue to grow in a vertical direction. The total depth of root penetration into the soil profile is up to 1.2 m. The performance and characteristics of the root system formation in *Salix fragilis* L. of seed origin can be evaluated at these sites in a similar way.

Populus tremula L.: a taxon of very high reclamation importance, little damaged by biotic factors. Rhizological characterization of individual trees of seed origin at the age under 10 years on Anthroposol

formed from coal ash only shows the formation of the uniformly distributed or one-sided system of horizontal roots penetrating into the soil-profile width of 7 m, numerous vertical anchor roots and the shorter taproot (taproot laterals), which is bent, similarly like in *Salix alba* L., to a horizontal position at a depth of more than 0.4 m in the majority of the trees. *Populus nigra* L. and *Populus alba* L. are of the same reclamation importance at this site and have the same rhizological characteristics.

Table 2. Characteristics of forest tree species development

| Locality (reclamation state) | Tree species | No. of individuals | Root width (cm) | | | Root depth (cm) | | | Shoots (cm) | | |
|------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|------|---------|-----------------|------|---------|-------------|------|---------|
| | | | max. | min. | average | max. | min. | average | max. | min. | average |
| Panský les ("B") | <i>Quercus robur</i> L. | 6 | 120 | 70 | 98 | 50 | 30 | 38 | 118 | 40 | 66 |
| | <i>Betula verrucosa</i> Ehrh. | 3 | 350 | 250 | 293 | 45 | 15 | 27 | 390 | 220 | 303 |
| Panský les ("D") | <i>Populus tremula</i> L. | 4 | 385 | 150 | 383 | 100 | 50 | 80 | 420 | 350 | 383 |
| | <i>Salix fragilis</i> L. | 2 | 250 | 110 | 180 | 80 | 50 | 65 | 430 | 245 | 338 |
| Chvaletice ("D") | <i>Betula verrucosa</i> Ehrh. | 20 | 730 | 410 | 549 | 55 | 40 | 43 | 455 | 190 | 316 |
| | <i>Salix alba</i> L. | 16 | 950 | 260 | 543 | 115 | 50 | 69 | 350 | 65 | 217 |
| | <i>Populus nigra</i> L. | 3 | 800 | 650 | 717 | 90 | 50 | 63 | 620 | 500 | 523 |
| Chvaletice ("A") | <i>Quercus rubra</i> L. | 10 | 135 | 105 | 118 | 40 | 35 | 38 | 145 | 115 | 125 |
| | <i>Alnus glutinosa</i> (L.) Gaertn. | 13 | 425 | 330 | 372 | 40 | 35 | 38 | 345 | 280 | 311 |
| | <i>Robinia pseudoacacia</i> L. | 7 | 425 | 350 | 390 | 40 | 35 | 37 | 385 | 280 | 318 |

Table 4. Contents of basal nutrients in the assimilatory tissues of forest tree species

| Locality (reclamation state) | Tree species | Content (% of dry matter) | | | | |
|--------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|---------------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| | | P | Ca | Mg | K | N |
| Chvaletice ("A") | <i>Pinus sylvestris</i> L. | 0.12 | 0.45 | 0.17 | 0.52 | 1.57 |
| | <i>Populus tremula</i> L. | 0.20 | 2.07 | 0.34 | 0.82 | 2.35 |
| | <i>Betula verrucosa</i> Ehrh. | 0.24 | 0.93 | 0.40 | 1.03 | 2.51 |
| Chvaletice ("D") | <i>Pinus sylvestris</i> L. | 0.18 | 0.20 | 0.99 | 0.87 | 1.85 |
| | <i>Populus tremula</i> L. | 0.20 | 1.21 | 0.28 | 1.95 | 2.40 |
| | <i>Betula verrucosa</i> Ehrh. | 0.28 | 0.84 | 0.36 | 0.84 | 2.88 |
| Mineral contents in plants (BENEŠ 1992) | <i>Pinus sylvestris</i> L. | 0.14–0.30 | 0.20–0.60 | 0.10–0.20 | 0.40–0.80 | 1.10–1.70 |
| | <i>Populus tremula</i> L. | 0.18–0.30 | 0.30–1.50 | 0.20–0.30 | 1.20–1.80 | 1.80–2.50 |
| | <i>Betula verrucosa</i> Ehrh. | 0.15–0.30 | 0.30–1.50 | 0.15–0.30 | 1.00–1.50 | 2.50–4.00 |

dumpsites without additives (CaO) can be considered as a material that can be used for forestry purposes without taking any complicated measures, which is also confirmed by the nutrient status (Table 4) recorded on coal ash deposited by hydraulic sluicing and on Anthroposol with the overlaying of the compacted stabilize with soil layer and which corresponds to the status reported for natural soils (BENEŠ 1994). A rhizological problem of Anthroposols formed from coal ash only is that the specific physical properties of soil (high porosity, low bulk density) are invariable in the whole profile (in contrast with natural soils), which could be the cause of rather frequent windthrows in some tree species taxa at older age; at sites with the overlaying of the compacted stabilize with soil layer up to 0.5 m in thickness the problem is deformations of the vertical part of the root system at the age of 5 years (roots change the direction of their growth to the horizontal one in the contact area composed of the stabilize). It will also be necessary to apply the knowledge of the growth of tree species of seed origin to this problem of the root system development on such Anthroposol because the presented characterization is information acquired from reforestation with a trench planter. Especially *Robinia pseudoacacia* L., *Betula verrucosa* Ehrh., *Salix alba* L., *Salix fragilis* L., *Populus tremula* L., *Populus nigra* L., *Populus alba* L., and also *Pinus sylvestris* L. can be considered as the tree species taxa of very high reclamation importance characterized by good performance already in the first vegetation series of primary succession on Anthroposols formed from coal ash only. Their typical rhizological trait at the age under ten years is the high density of terminal rootlets in the central part (Fig. 5, shown in *Populus nigra* L.) and the formation of the sizeable system of horizontal

roots that is complemented by numerous vertical anchor roots in *Salix alba* L., *Salix fragilis* L., *Populus tremula* L., *Populus nigra* L., *Populus alba* L. and the taproot which changes the direction of growth to a horizontal one at a depth of 0.7 m in more than 80% of individuals and the taproot in *Pinus sylvestris* L. which does not show any marked deformations to the depth of 0.6 m in 90% of evaluated individuals.

References

- ALONSO F.J., VILADRICH O., SERRASOLSES I., GRACA O., 2002. Use of sewage sludge for restoration of degraded lands. Man and soil at the Third Millennium. Proceedings International Congress of the European Society for Soil Conservation, Valencia, Spain 2000, 2: 2159–2166.
- ATHY E.R., KEIFFER C.H., STEVENS M.H., 2006. Effects of mulch seedlings and soil on a closed landfill. *Restoration Ecology*, 14: 223–241.
- BENEŠ S., 1994. Obsahy a bilance prvků ve sférách životního prostředí II. část. Praha, MZe ČR: 159.
- ČERMÁK P., KOHEL J., 2005. Lesnická rekultivace složišť stabilizátu. Soil and Water, Praha, VÚMOP: 7–11.
- DOBSON M.C., MOFFAT A.J., 1999. Examination of tree and root performance on closed landfills in Merseyside. *Arboricultural Journal*, 23: 261–272.
- HERYNEK J., 1997. Biotechnická rekultivace odkaliště Panský les. [Výroční zpráva.] Brno, MZLU: 20.
- HERYNEK J., 1998. Provozní ověřování výsadby stromových kultur na odkališti Panský les. [Výroční zpráva.] Brno, MZLU: 19.
- JUWARKAR A.S., BAL A.S., JUWARKAR A., 1993. Manganese mine spoil dump productivity restoration using pressmud and sewage sludge. *Journal of Industrial Pollution Control*, 9: 1–7.
- MALÝ L., ŠPIŘÍK F., 1975. Rekultivace opuštěných odkališť popela. Metodika č. 13–14. Praha, ÚVTIZ: 56.

MINX A., 2003. Metodika pro jednotný a optimální způsob zajištění biologických rekultivací složišť VEP ČEZ, a. s. Brandýs nad Labem, ÚHÚL: 80.

SRIVASTAVA R., KUMAR A., RAI A.M., SINGH L., 1995. Biological method of flysh stabilization through afforestation on ash dump yards near thermal power station, Panki (Kanpur). *Indian Forester*, 121: 81–87.

ŠPIŘÍK F., 1973. Lesnická rekultivace opuštěných složišť popela. [Výzkumná zpráva.] Zbraslav, VÚM: 62.

Received for publication February 4, 2008

Accepted after corrections April 14, 2008

Lesnická rekultivace složišť vedlejších energetických produktů (VEP)

ABSTRAKT: Je popsána problematika rekultivace složišť popelovin – vedlejších energetických produktů (VEP), pocházejících ze spalování hnědého uhlí v tepelných elektrárnách. Hodnotí se půdní vlastnosti vytvářených antropozemí a růstová vitalita dřevin – *Quercus robur* L., *Quercus rubra* L., *Pinus sylvestris* L., *Betula verrucosa* Ehrh., *Populus tremula* L., *Populus nigra* L., *Salix fragilis* L., *Salix alba* L., *Alnus glutinosa* (L.) Gaertn. Nejlepší růstovou vitalitou na těchto stanovištích disponují dřeviny semenného původu z garnitury vegetace primární sukcese. Deformace křivého kořene (postranních křivých kořenů) ve stáří do 10 let byla zjištěna na antropozemi z popelovin u *Salix alba* L., *Salix fragilis* L., *Populus tremula* L., *Populus nigra* L. a *Populus alba* L. a na překryvu ztuhlého stabilizátu zúrodnitelnou zeminou do 0,5 m u *Pinus sylvestris* L., *Alnus glutinosa* (L.) Gaertn. a *Quercus rubra* L.

Klíčová slova: lesnická rekultivace; antropozem; složiště popelovin; vedlejší energetické produkty; půdní vlastnosti; růstová vitalita; kořenový systém

Corresponding author:

Ing. PETR ČERMÁK, CSc., Výzkumný ústav meliorací a ochrany půdy, v.v.i., Žabovřeská 250, 156 27 Praha 5-Zbraslav, Česká republika
tel.: + 420 257 921 640, fax: + 420 257 921 246, e-mail: cermak@vumop.cz
